

European Journal of Economic and Financial Research

ISSN: 2501-9430 ISSN-L: 2501-9430 Available on-line at: http://www.oapub.org/soc

DOI: 10.46827/ejefr.v7i3.1527

Volume 7 | Issue 3 | 2023

EFFECT OF CREDIT RISK MANAGEMENT ON THE FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE OF BANKING SECTOR OF BANGLADESH: A STUDY ON GENERATION-BASED SELECTED LISTED COMMERCIAL BANKS

Md. Kutub Uddin¹, H. M. Mosarof Hossain², Mushfiqur Rahman³ⁱ ¹Associate Professor, Department of Mathematics, University of Dhaka, Bangladesh

²Dr., Professor, Department of Finance, University of Dhaka, Bangladesh ³Assistant Manager (Investment, Renewable Energy Projects)-IDCOL, Bangladesh

Abstract:

The financial sector of the country is mostly comprised of banking institutions; those are leading the economy with great exposure with the contribution to the development process. However, the banking sector of Bangladesh is disturbed by the large-scale amount of non-performing loans while has become an essential part of the finance of the industries. As part of the measurement of credit risk and macro factors average lending rate, inflation, NPL size, capital adequacy ratio, liquidity ratio have been selected to test the influence on the financial performance found through the return on asset of the selected banks. To conduct the study 9 banks of three generations have been selected for the period of 2016 to 2022. Robust least square method of regression and error correction term have been run to oversee the real impact on financial performance while endogenity and random walk in the values are being considered to overcome through a dynamic regression model. NPL has a negative impact on the performance and average lending rate, inflation, liquidity ratio and capital adequacy ratio bring a positive impact on the financial performance of the banks. Breusch-Pagan LM test confirms that cross-sectional dependency exists and VAR serial correlation test finds autocorrelation in the data set. The policy implication of this study suggests that the high NPL ratio must be reduced and CAR and LR must be improved to get the desired results of the performance. Strong

ⁱCorrespondence: email <u>mushfiqurrahman742@gmail.com</u>

fiscal and banking regulation should implement so that governance can be ensured to create responsibility and financial strength.

JEL: E4, D81, E33, E44

Keywords: credit risk, financial performance, NPL, capital adequacy ratio, return on assets, robust least square, cointegration

1. Introduction

The banking sector of Bangladesh is facing a large-scale non-performing loan and liquidity problem. Around 61 banks are providing financial services to the economy. Listed banks of the stock market are disclosing sensitive information from which investors in this industry is making decision. Credit and liquidity management of the banks are playing a key role in the governance and financial stability of the market. Disruption in the fund flow and excessive bad loans are frequently hampering the investment and market development of the country. Bangladeshi government banks are responsible for more than 65% of the total bad loans while other private commercial banks are slightly making non-performing loans in the competitive environment in the banking industry. Liquidity crisis and lending rate volatility are the facts of instability of performance. The inflation rate is often taken and altered by the central bank with the policy rate changes that significantly affect the loan size. The amount of bad loans is on the trend of being increased with time. The comparative economic growth rate and bad loan rate picture are depicted below:





Md. Kutub Uddin, H. M. Mosarof Hossain, Mushfiqur Rahman EFFECT OF CREDIT RISK MANAGEMENT ON THE FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE OF BANKING SECTOR OF BANGLADESH: A STUDY ON GENERATION-BASED SELECTED LISTED COMMERCIAL BANKS



From the analysis, it is notified that the size of the non-performing loan is closely related to the GDP growth rate. During COVID-19 the economic growth rate measured by GDP growth rate has declined and in response to that rate of non-performing loans had also abated. Under the impulse response scenario, it is found that for one unit shock arises in the endogenous variable and makes changes in the other explanatory variables which reveals the impact of bank-specific and macro factors on the growth or performance of the banks in the industry. The impact of the innovations derived from the shocks on the variables. Response of return on assets, NPL is mostly negatively influenced by the variables in the presence of shock except for the liquidity ratio. Response of capital adequacy ratio, average lending rate with the negative shock is positively related to the inflation, non-performing loan and liquidity ratio. Under the robust least square analysis and error correction term estimation, the real influence and needed policy implementation action will be important to destine the future growth and stability in the financial banking sector.

2. Literature Review

The literature review of this paper has brought up different findings related to Financial Performance (FP) that have been explained by different credit risk and bank-specific factors. In the hypothesis, Return on Assets (RoA) of the commercial banks has been taken into consideration as an indicator of FP of the commercial banks. Several empirical researches have been conducted to understand the effect of credit risk management on

the FP of the banks. Hakim, S. and Neaime, S., 2001, tried to investigate the impact of variables like liquidity, credit and capital on the bank's profitability of Egypt and Lebanon. The study found that there is a significant impact on the rules and laws of the bank due to sound risk management actions and applications.

Hosna, A., Manzura, B. and Juanjuan, S., 2009 on their study found that financial performance as measured by RoE has been affected more by Non-performing Loan (NPL), rather than capital adequacy ratio. They also found that the effect of credit risk management on the profitability of the banks wasn't similar for all. Njanike, K., 2009., found that the banking crisis happened due to the absence of effective credit risk management and the financial crisis was led by the inadequate risk management system. Kithinji, A.M., 2010 found that the bank's profitability was guided by other variables than credit and non-performing loans.

Aduda, J. and Gitonga, J., 2011 found in their study that credit risk management has a reasonable effect on profitability. Aruwa, S.A. and Musa, A.O., 2014 on their study investigated the impact of credit risk management and other risk components on the financial performance of banks. From their study, they found that there is a strong relationship between risk components and the financial performance of the banks. Boahene, S.H., Dasah, J. and Agyei, S.K., 2012 investigated the relationship between the profitability of the banks and credit risk. They found a positive relationship between these two.

San, O.T. and Heng, T.B., 2013 in their study investigated the factors affecting the profitability of Malaysian commercial banks. They used ROA, ROE, and NIM as a substitute for profitability and used different bank-specific factors and macroeconomic variables. The study concluded that macroeconomic variables have a positive impact on the profitability of the banks. Bank-specific factors like liquidity and bank size have a positive impact on profitability while capitalization has a negative impact on it.

Poudel, R.P.S., 2012 investigated among different factors of credit risk management with the profitability of the banks. The study concluded that the default rate has the most impact on the bank's financial performance. Musyoki, D. and Kadubo, A.S., 2012 used different variables related to credit risk management to assess the bank's performance. They concluded all the variables have a negative impact on the financial performance of the bank. It was also concluded that the default rate has the most significant impact among other variables on the financial performance of the banks. Kaaya, I. and Pastory, D., 2013 found that credit risk indicators affect negatively on the financial performance of banks. Ogboi, C. and Unuafe, O.K., 2013 on their study concluded that sound credit risk management and capital adequacy affect the financial performance of the banks. Abiola, I. and Olausi, A.S., 2014 found that bank's profitability is affected by credit risk management. Kurawa, J.M. and Garba, S., 2014 on their study found that different credit risk management factors like default rate (DR), cost per loan asset (CLA), and capital adequacy ratio (CAR) have an effect on the bank's profitability. Alshatti, A.S., 2015 in their research found that credit risk management indicators have a significant effect on the financial performance of commercial banks.

3. Material and Methods

The dependent variable for our study is financial performance as measured by Return on Assets (ROA) and the key regressors for the model are credit risk and bank-specific variables. Non-performing loans (NPL) and Capital Adequacy Ratio (CAR) are taken as measures of credit risk while Average Lending Rate (ALR) and Liquidity Ratio (LR) are the bank-specific variables.

Several studies have found that a few micro and macro variables may have an impact on financial performance and hence, must be controlled. Inflation is one such macroeconomic variable that was taken as a control variable for the purpose of this paper. We have collected panel data on financial performance from 9 prominent banks in Bangladesh. The data was collected from the audited financial statements of the respective banks for the period spanning 2016 to 2022. A total of 63 observations were taken for the analysis of this paper.

Tuble 1. Vullubles Osed in the Study			with measurements		
		Variable	Symbol	Measurement	
Dependent	Financial	Return on Asset	ROA	Net Income/	
Variable	Performance	Return on Asset		Total Assets	
		Non-Performing Loans	NPL	Total nonperforming loan/	
	Creadit Diale			Total loans	
Independent Variables	Credit Risk	Capital Adequacy Ratio	CAR	Risk weighted assets/	
				Total equity	
		Average Lending Rate	ALR	Net interest income/	
	Bank Specific			Total assets	
	Factors	Liquidity Ratio	LR	Total loans/	
				Total deposits	
Control			IR	Annual inflation	
Control		Inflation Rate		rate declared by	
Variable				Bangladesh Bank	

Table 1: Variables Used in the Study	y with Measurements
--------------------------------------	---------------------

Model specification:

 $ROA_{it} = \gamma_0 + \gamma_1 NPL_{it} + \gamma_2 CAR_{it} + \gamma_3 ALR_{it} + \gamma_4 LR_{it} + \gamma_5 IR_{it} + \epsilon_{it}$

where, γ_0 = intercept; $\gamma_1 - \gamma_5$ = coefficients of independent and control variables; and ϵ_{it} = residuals.

Error Correction Term for the Long Run Causality:

D(NPL) = C(9)*(ROA(-1) + 0.51793951745*NPL(-1) + 0.0996059648549 *LIQUIDITY_RATIO(-1) - 126.380363887*INFLATION(-1) - 0.20595641977*CAR(-1) + 0.219747659803*AVERAGE_LENDING_RATE(-1) + 6.98443992616) + C(10)*D(ROA(-1)) + C(11)*D(NPL(-1)) + C(12)*D(LIQUIDITY_RATIO(-1)) + C(13)*D(INFLATION(-1)) + C(14)*D(CAR(-1)) + C(15)*D(AVERAGE_LENDING_RATE(-1)) + C(16)

To test the methodology, unit root test, serial correlation test, cross-sectional dependence test, error correction model will be conducted. The robust least square analysis will be brought to reach the expected results of the model. A diagnostic test will be conducted to ensure the normality of the values of the model.

4. Results and Discussion

4.1 Diagnostic Test Results

The data analysis part of the study mainly concerns with the movement of the major bank-specific and macro factorial influence on the financial performance that needs to ensure the stability and normality of the values of explanatory variables. To check the originality and the identity of the data descriptive analysis is given below:

Tuble 2. Descriptive Titulysis					
Variables	Mean	Maximum	Minimum	Standard Deviation	Skewness
ROA	0.03	0.68	0.00	0.10	5.42
NPL	0.05	0.09	0.02	0.02	0.73
Liquidity Ratio	0.86	1.06	0.06	0.19	-2.93
Inflation	0.06	0.07	0.06	0.02	2.01
CAR	0.14	0.19	0.08	0.01	-0.06
Average Lending Rate	0.02	0.07	0.00	0.00	1.49

Table 2: Descriptive Analysis

Note: Descriptive Statistics.

Capital Adequacy Ratio and Non-Performing Loan values are close to normally distributed whereas Return on Asset, Liquidity Ratio, and Inflation brings skewness of more than 2 which shows data are not normally distributed. Time variant skewness of the explanatory variables exposes random moves in the model derived.

4.2 Cross-Sectional Dependence Test

Test Name	Statistic	P- Value
Breusch- Pagan LM	72.53	0.00*
Pesaran Scaled	4.30	0.00*

Note: Cross-Sectional Dependence Test Results. Significance is denoted by the probability of 5% with * sign.

Under cross-sectional dependency check, Average Lending Rate, Liquidity Ratio, Inflation, and Bad Loans can interchangeably influence one another. It stands that a change in one of the explanatory variables can make a change in all other or some of the instrumental variables of the model analyzed. Breusch Pagan LM test confirms that dependency exists in the model that jointly requires overseeing all the policy rates over time so that control in the market can be feasible.

4.3 Panel Unit Root Test

Panel unit root test brings the stability of the values in the set of the model. This is stated below:

	ADF Fisher Chi	Levin, Lin &	Stationary at First	
Name of Variable	Square Value	amp; Chu t*	Difference Level	
ROA	63.73	-33.76	Chationarra	
KOA	(0.00)*	(0.00)	Stationary	
NIDI	13.14	1.39	-2.27	
NPL	(0.78)	(0.92)	(0.02)*	
Liquidity Ratio	34.66	-167	Chatianama	
	(0.01)*	(0.04)*	Stationary	
Inflation	40.35	39.36	-10.99	
Inflation	(0.00)*	(1.00)	(0.00)	
CAR	25.12	-8.33	<u>CL</u>	
	(0.12)	(0.00)*	Stationary	
Assertance I an dine Data	11.52	-0.78	-6.32	
Average Lending Rate	(0.87)	(0.22)	(0.00)*	

Note: Levin, Lin & amp; Chu t stat value is significant and stationary at 5% level denoted by * and first difference level statistic value is presented with the corresponding probability value in parenthesis.

Under the unit root test, the stationary position of the variables is confirmed so that the expected outcome may not lead to misleading direction. Returns on Assets, Liquidity Ratio, Capital Adequacy Ratio are stationary at the prime stage. But NPL, Inflation, and Average Lending Rate are stationary the first difference that resolves the random walk or uncertain volatility in the values of the data. It is mandatory to make sure that our data are free from biasness and volatility to get the real picture of the study.

4.4 Cointegration Test

Long-run associationship among the explanatory variables is checked through this cointegration test. Fluctuations in the policy rates or macro factors should be traced to correct as quick as possible. It disturbs the favorable outcome. The results of KAO residual co-integration test is depicted below:

Test	T-statistic	P-Value
Augmented Dicky Fuller	0.99	0.16
Residual variance	0.0009	

Note: R^2 for co integration test is 32%. P value is significant at 5% level. Durbin Watson stat is 2.02.

From the analysis of the cointegration test, it is observed that no cointegration exists among the Non-Performing Loan, Liquidity Ratio, Inflation, and Average Lending Rate. Any disturbance in any one of the variables will not directly influence the others. Longrun cointegration is absent and dynamic change in the performance of the company will not result overnight due to change in one factor overnight. A single factor such as Inflation itself can impact the Return on Assets in the short and long run.

4.5 Serial Correlation LM Test

From 2016 to 2022 all the values of the past period can be interrelated and can disturb the expected outcome. Autocorrelation in the Inflation, Liquidity Ratio, Average Lending Rate, NPL will create instability and it will take time to make corrections of the term to come back to equilibrium. During the volatile period, company performance might be affected in the industry. Under Lag 2 and 3 outcome of LM test is given.

Lag Value	LRE* stat	Rao- F-Stat
	53.80	1.63
2	(0.03)	(0.3)
	107.55	4.26
3	(0.00)	(0.00)

Table 5: Serial Correlation L	.M Test
-------------------------------	---------

Note: The probability value is in the parenthesis and significant at the 5% level.

From vector autoregression LM test of autocorrelation, the values of the inflation, lending rate, NPL are serially correlated and residuals of the model can extort the relationship among the forecasting in the short run. A number of banks in the industry belong to three different generations and the activities are almost in the same race. In the absence of large magnitudes and operational change, the regular results of the performance of the banks are highly correlated with itself. Strong serial correlation in the weak form of the financial market creates volatility.

4.6 Panel Least Square of Vector Error Correction Estimates

Co-integration Term	Coefficient	P-value
C(11)	-0.45	0.00*
C(13)	-0.25	0.20
C(14)	0.12	0.15
C(16)	-0.004	0.02*

Table 6: Panel Least Square of Vector Error Correction Estimates

Note: Probability is denoted by * and significant at a 5% level.

Error correction term here expresses that the value of the coefficient is negative and significant at 5% level and long-run causality exists between NPL and Inflation. Short-run causality exists in the Capital Adequacy Ratio. Economic growth and other variables can be unstable and it will come back to the equilibrium by 51% as quickly as it happens

in the performance of the banks. Any shortfall or uncertainty in the return will make a correction to return back to the balance condition within half of its non-volatility period. However, in the interim period of the anarchy, gain from the market can distort the return.

4.7 Robust Least Square Analysis and Implication

Variable	Values
NPL	-0.06
INF L	(0.01)*
Inflation	0.10
	(0.03)*
I : it. Datia	0.00
Liquidity Ratio	(0.04)*
CAR	0.02
CAR	(0.87)
Average Lending Rate	0.16
	(0.00)*

 Table 4: Robust Least Square Analysis

Note: Adjusted R^2 for regression is 54%. P-Value is in the parenthesis and 5% significance is denoted by *. Akaike info criterion is 92.49 in this result.

The robust least square analysis shows that banking performance is influenced by the variation in the explanatory variables. A non-performing loan is increasing over time. Due to this reason each hundred percent increase in the NPL return on asset is decreased by 6% and this is significant to express this impact. Inflation positively interrupts the banking performance by 10% for each hundred percent which is valid at a 3% significant level. Liquidity positively influences the return of the banks. Improving the liquidity condition intensifies the deposit condition of the banks and it results in the smooth rise in the profitability of the banks. The capital adequacy ratio is the measurement of the bank's strength and market position. Under Basel III criteria capital adequacy ratio should be maintained at 12% around. Sustenance in the CAR can motivate banking performance. CAR can positively change the return level of the banks but this is less important to interact in the overall performance. The Average Lending Rate has a positive impact on the return of the banks. Banking performance relies on the lending rate as the fund flows vary on the basis of the changes in the policy rate (Adebayo et al., 2011). Each 16% increase in the lending rate creates a 100% return for the banks. The significant impact on the return of the banks as a matter of positive move in the lending rate is at the 5% level. Moreover, positive change in the performance must be realized by the changes in the values of the factors as it is expected in the economy in which it operates.

5. Recommendations & Conclusions

As a developing country, Bangladesh is deliberately trying to extend its economic performance and growth in the world. The banking sector of the country is troubled by multiple micro and macro factors. Inflation, Average Lending Rate, Liquidity Ratio, CAR brings a positive influence on the performance of the banks in the economy whereas NPL generates a negative impact on the return of the banks (Masood and Ashraf, 2012). However, the expected impact on the performance of the bank from NPL rising is negative and it is reliable. Other variables of the study are also true as positive changes in the bank-specific and macroeconomic factors of the study might influence the profitability and performance. In the analysis of the results of the robust least square, the problems of the values of the factors are automatically corrected and it provides a reliable outcome. It can be said that NPL must be reduced to sustain the positive return over time. Facing the challenges in the competitive market, macro and other policy-related factors must be complied with in such a way that will create stability. Any fluctuation in the level of the market economy, adaptation of new guides on the derivation of the policy and internal governance regarding the interest rate, CAR will help to return to a stable situation (Blum and Hellwig, 1995). The management of the banks must take strategies to control the rate of NPL. In the same race, the authority must implement a global banking strategy and guidelines on governance so that the economic return of each bank can be achieved. In order to survive the rising pressure in the banking industry, a high liquidity position and CAR ratio must be needed (Hamza, 2017). The findings of the study are based on the selected banks only. This model can be used further for more specific other objective-based research on the same ground. The selection of variables and analysis of this study are trustworthy as it matches with the previous findings. Policymakers might not avoid the necessity of adopting time and environment-sensitive decisions so that anomalies in the market can be removed. Financial distortion in the policy rates and macro factors should be handled with a prudent hand that will create trust and confidence in the economy and removes unhealthy race at all. The lending rate that has a positive impact on performance must be checked of (Chimkono et al., 2016). All these factors of credit risk management can influence the profit in different dimensions so based on their level of impact accurate action for market adjustment is will be needed.

Acknowledgements

There is no funding for the publishing of this article. Three authors only contributed to preparation of the article; there is no more acknowledgements here.

Conflict of Interest Statement

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

About the Authors

Md. Kutub Uddin is an Associate Professor of Department of Mathematics, University of Dhaka, Bangladesh. He is also a PhD student on finance and an MBA from IBA, University of Dhaka. He is a former lecturer of BUET. His research interest includes Corporate Governance, Financial Market, Banking Industry.

M. Mosarof Hossain is a Professor of Finance at University of Dhaka, Bangladesh. His research interest includes Financial Market and Islamic Finance.

Mushfiqur Rahman is an Assistant Manager in the Investment Department of the Renewable Energy Projects wing at Infrastructure Development Company Ltd. (IDCOL), Bangladesh and holds MBA & BBA major in Finance from University of Dhaka, Bangladesh. His research interest includes Financial Market, Alternative Investment, Project Finance and Financial Management, Macroeconomic factors.

References

- Abiola, I. and Olausi, A.S., 2014. The impact of credit risk management on the commercial banks performance in Nigeria. *International Journal of Management and Sustainability*, 3(5), pp.295-306.
- Adebayo, M., Adeyanju, D. and Olabode, S. (2011), Liquidity management and commercial banks' profitability in Nigeria, Research Journal of Finance and Accounting, Vol. 2 No. 8.
- Aduda, J. and Gitonga, J., 2011. The relationship between credit risk management and profitability among the commercial banks in Kenya. *Journal of Modern Accounting and Auditing*, 7(9), p.934.
- Alshatti, A.S., 2015. The effect of credit risk management on financial performance of the Jordanian commercial banks. *Investment management and financial innovations*, 12(1), pp.338-345.
- Aruwa, S.A. and Musa, A.O., 2014. Risk components and the financial performance of deposit money banks in Nigeria. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Entrepreneurship*, 1(11), pp.514-522.
- Blum, J. and Hellwig, M. (1995), The macroeconomic implications of capital adequacy requirements for banks, European Economic Review, pp. 739-749.
- Boahene, S.H., Dasah, J. and Agyei, S.K., 2012. Credit risk and profitability of selected banks in Ghana. *Research Journal of Finance and Accounting*, 3(7), pp.6-14.
- Chimkono, E.E., Muturi, W. and Njeru, A. (2016), Effect of non-performing loans and other factors on performance of commercial banks in Malawi, International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management, Vol. IV, pp. 1-15.
- Hakim, S. and Neaime, S., 2001. Performance & credit risk in banking: A comparative study for Egypt and Lebanon. Economic Research Forum for the Arab Countries, Iran & Turkey.

- Hamza, S.M. (2017), Impact of credit risk management on banks performance: a case study in Pakistan banks, European Journal of Business and Management, Vol. 9 No. 1, pp. 57-64.
- Hosna, A., Manzura, B. and Juanjuan, S., 2009. Credit risk management and profitability in commercial banks in Sweden. *rapport nr.: Master Degree Project 2009: 36*.
- Kaaya, I. and Pastory, D., 2013. Credit Risk and Commercial Banks Performance in Tanzania: a Panel Data Analysis.
- Kithinji, A.M., 2010. Credit risk management and profitability of commercial banks in Kenya.
- Kurawa, J.M. and Garba, S., 2014. An evaluation of the effect of credit risk management (CRM) on the profitability of Nigerian banks. *Journal of Modern Accounting and Auditing*, 10(1), p.104.
- Masood, O. and Ashraf, M. (2012), "Bank-specific and macroeconomic profitability determinants of Islamic banks: the case of different countries", Qualitative Research in Financial Markets, Vol. 4 Nos 2/3, pp. 255-268.
- Musyoki, D. and Kadubo, A.S., 2012. The impact of credit risk management on the financial performance of banks in Kenya for the period. *International Journal of Business and Public Management*, 2(2), pp.72-80.
- Njanike, K., 2009. The impact of effective credit risk management on bank survival. *Annals of the University of Petroşani, Economics*, *9*(2), pp.173-184.
- Ogboi, C. and Unuafe, O.K., 2013. Impact of credit risk management and capital adequacy on the financial performance of commercial banks in Nigeria. *Journal of emerging issues in economics, finance and banking*, 2(3), pp.703-717.
- Poudel, R.P.S., 2012. The impact of credit risk management on financial performance of commercial banks in Nepal. International Journal of Arts and Commerce, 1(5), pp.9-15.
- San, O.T. and Heng, T.B., 2013. Factors affecting the profitability of Malaysian commercial banks. *African Journal of Business Management*, 7(8), pp.649-660.

Appendix

a. Panel Least Square

Dependent Variable: D(NPL) Method: Panel Least Squares Date: 06/15/23 Time: 19:15 Sample (adjusted): 2018 2022 Periods included: 5 Cross-sections included: 9 Total panel (balanced) observations: 45 D(NPL) = C(9)*(ROA(-1) + 0.51793951745*NPL(-1) + 0.0996059648549 *LIQUIDITY_RATIO(-1) - 126.380363887*INFLATION(-1) - 0.20595641977*CAR(-1) + 0.219747659803*AVERAGE_LENDING_RA TE(-1) + 6.98443992616) + C(10)*D(ROA(-1)) + C(11)*D(NPL(-1)) + C(12)*D(LIQUIDITY_RATIO(-1)) + C(13)*D(INFLATION(-1)) + C(14) *D(CAR(-1)) + C(15)*D(AVERAGE_LENDING_RATE(-1)) + C(16)							
	Coefficient	Std. Error	t-Statistic	Prob.			
C(9) C(10) C(11) C(12) C(13) C(14) C(15) C(16)	0.005430 0.004269 -0.454119 0.001445 -0.255090 0.124842 -0.020012 -0.004303	0.022563 0.026691 0.141890 0.008929 0.196710 0.084863 0.165937 0.001758	0.240652 0.159960 -3.200505 0.161867 -1.296785 1.471098 -0.120600 -2.447548	0.8112 0.8738 0.0028 0.8723 0.2027 0.1497 0.9047 0.9047			
R-squared Adjusted R-squared S.E. of regression Sum squared resid Log likelihood F-statistic Prob(F-statistic)	0.264299 0.125112 0.009192 0.003126 151.5781 1.898881 0.097650	Mean dependent var S.D. dependent var Akaike info criterion Schwarz criterion Hannan-Quinn criter. Durbin-Watson stat		-0.002034 0.009827 -6.381247 -6.060062 -6.261512 1.788665			

b. Robust Least Square

Dependent Variable: ROA Method: Robust Least Squares Date: 06/15/23 Time: 19:57 Sample: 2016 2022 Included observations: 63 Method: M-estimation M settings: weight=Bisquare, tuning=4.685, scale=MAD (median centered) Huber Type I Standard Errors & Covariance								
Variable	Coefficient	Std. Error	z-Statistic	Prob.				
NPL INFLATION LIQUIDITY_RATIO CAR AVERAGE_LENDING_RATE C	-0.059988 0.108837 0.004238 0.002949 0.161728 -0.002497	0.023588 0.049626 0.002032 0.019313 0.033763 0.005145	-2.543151 2.193139 2.085217 0.152671 4.790070 -0.485242	0.0110 0.0283 0.0370 0.8787 0.0000 0.6275				
Robust Statistics								
R-squared Rw-squared Akaike info criterion Deviance Rn-squared statistic	0.286912 0.537096 92.49582 0.000522 49.30325	Adjusted R-squared Adjust Rw-squared Schwarz criterion Scale Prob(Rn-squared stat.)		0.224360 0.537096 108.2942 0.002501 0.000000				
Non-robust Statistics								
Mean dependent var S.E. of regression	0.029329 0.112605	S.D. dependent var Sum squared resid		0.105648 0.722752				

Creative Commons licensing terms

Authors will retain copyright to their published articles agreeing that a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0) terms will be applied to their work. Under the terms of this license, no permission is required from the author(s) or publisher for members of the community to copy, distribute, transmit or adapt the article content, providing a proper, prominent and unambiguous attribution to the authors in a manner that makes clear that the materials are being reused under permission of a Creative Commons License. Views, opinions and conclusions expressed in this research article are views, opinions and conclusions of the author(s).Open Access Publishing Group and European Journal of Economic and Financial Research shall not be responsible or answerable for any loss, damage or liability caused in relation to/arising out of conflict of interests, copyright violations and inappropriate or inaccurate use of any kind content related or integrated on the research work. All the published works are meeting the Open Access Publishing Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0).